



DATE: June 28, 2018

TO: Transportation Authority of Marin Board of Commissioners

FROM: Dianne Steinhauser, Executive Director
Dan Cherrier, Principal Project Delivery Manager

SUBJECT: Award of Contract for Crossing Guard Services and authorize various Inter-agency Agreements (Action), Agenda Item No. 8

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Authorize the Executive Director to enter into an agreement with All City Management Services for a Not to Exceed Amount of \$7,700,000 for Crossing Guard Services. The five-year Contract is to terminate July 31, 2023. Actual budget to be approved each year by the TAM Board.
2. Authorize the Executive Director to enter into Amendment 7 of Inter-agency Agreement A-FY 12/13-005 (FA) with Novato Unified School District for reimbursement of four crossing guards. Not to exceed amount to be increased by \$70,000 to \$358,000. The terminate date is to be extended to July 31, 2019.
3. Authorize the Executive Director to enter into Amendment 2 of Inter-agency Agreement A-FY17-02 with Larkspur Corte Madera School District for reimbursement of one crossing guard. Not to exceed amount to be increased by \$18,000 to \$51,000. The terminate date is to be extended to July 31, 2019.
4. Authorize the Executive Director to enter into Amendment 3 of Inter-agency Agreement A-FY 15/16-001 (FA) with Kentfield School District for reimbursement of one crossing guard. Not to exceed amount to be increased by \$9,000 to \$33,500. The terminate date is to be extended to July 31, 2019.

Note that on June 11th, 2018, the TAM Finance and Policy Executive Committee unanimously recommended approval of the Crossing Guard contract to All Cities Management Services.

BACKGROUND:

The TAM Crossing Guard program provides trained crossing guards for critical intersections throughout Marin County. As committed in the Transportation Sales Tax (Measure A) Expenditure Plan, the program uses trained crossing guards under contract to a professional company that specializes in crossing guard programs. Under contract to TAM, All City Management Services currently provides guards under the close supervision of TAM staff. The current 2017/2018 school year is the twelfth year during which crossing guards have been funded by the TAM Crossing Guard Program.

Historically very few firms have specialized in crossing guard services. Since the inception of the Program in 2006, TAM has entered into contracts with only two firms, All Cities Management Services (ACMS) and American Guard Services (AGS). A review of responses to Requests for Crossing Guard services across the State has shown that in many cases, these are the only two firms that respond to other agencies. Both firms are headquartered in southern California.

TAM used the services of ACMS from 2006 to 2009 and AGS from 2009 to 2012. A new search in 2012 resulted in the selection of AGS again for the 2012-2015 timeframe. The contract for 2015 to 2018 was awarded to ACMS.

ACMS had performance issues during the 2006 to 2009 contract including excessive absences, poor training, and incorrect billing. The selection of AGS in 2009 resulted in much improved service and attendance. However, the invoicing did require excessive staff time to correct the many mistakes. AGS performance dropped considerably during the final year of the 2012 to 2015 contract when a change occurred in the Regional Manager position. The contract is constructed in such a way, that a single point of contact is created to service all the requirements of the Program. The Regional Manager was the one-point contact and his absence was immediately felt. The service from ACMS for the 2015 to 2018 contract has been extremely satisfactory. Complaints are down, and billing issues have for the most part disappeared.

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS:

This past Spring, TAM issued a Request for Proposals for Crossing Guard Services. The same two firms responded, AGS and ACMS. A selection panel was formed consisting of the Public Works Director from San Anselmo, the TAM crossing guard consultant, the TAM Deputy Executive Director and one additional TAM staff member. Based on a review of the written proposals, the clear choice was ACMS. However, due to the cost magnitude of the award it was decided to have both firms attend an interview.

The following scoring criteria was utilized of the evaluation process. The numbers indicate the maximum possible points for each category

Project understanding and approach, including an understanding of the role of TAM. Overall Management Plan.	20
Qualifications and specific experience of Key Team Members.	20
Capacity to provide qualified personnel and Staffing Plan.	20
Total Program Cost and Hourly Rates	20
Knowledge of unique requirements, including background checks, minimum wage, Marin County Living Wage, Federal and State laws concerning show-up times and split shift payments. Ability to provide TAM with specific background information.	15
Similar Crossing Guard Experience	5
Total	100

AGS was very competitive on price as they were approximately \$3.50 per hour less than ACMS. This would translate into a total award of approximately \$7,000,000. However, the selection panel was concerned with the lack of response during the interview by the local San Leandro based manager that would be responsible for the Program. He did not personally respond to the questions and did not provide a resume as to his qualifications.

The primary concern regarding AGS occurred when the agencies with current or recent contracts with AGS were contacted. Five agencies were contacted, and one gave a modest recommendation for AGS. Four of the other agencies stated that multiple problems occurred with AGS including lack of ability to provide sufficient staff, lack of knowledgeable staff, and billing issues. The programs ranged from agencies contracting for 10 guards up to 70 guards.

Three of the agencies contacted were in the Bay Area and were under the same AGS management that would be assigned to the TAM contract. Two of the agencies contacted recently switched back to ACMS, even though ACMS was more expensive. The scale of the TAM Program is larger than these others and any performance issues (especially attendance) would be very difficult to rectify without another selection process. This would require a minimum of several weeks, during which time locations could remain unguarded.

The selection panel scored AGS low for their Management Plan and the capacity to provide sufficient personnel. AGS did receive high marks for their lower price.

Four reference checks were made for ACMS. All four indicated superior service with the only issues being incorrect invoicing.

The selection panel was unanimous in their choice to award the crossing guard contract to ACMS. The attendance issues that have been associated recently with AGS were the primary factor in arriving at this decision, with the qualification unknowns of the local manager also being a concern. The safety aspects of this contract for our local school children were of paramount concern for the selection panel.

TAM has historically offered school districts the opportunity to add additional crossing guards on a reimbursed basis. School staff from Novation Unified, Kentfield and Larkspur Corte Madera School Districts have informed TAM staff that they wish to continue this practice for the 2018/2019 school year. Novato Unified will continue to pay for four guards, while Larkspur Corte Madera will maintain one guard. Kentfield has required their guard for the morning hours only and wish to maintain that level. These guards are provided to our partner school districts at cost without mark-up. TAM staff treat these sites the same as TAM paid for sites, and provide identical oversight including site audits.

FISCAL CONSIDERATION:

The proposals requested that the provided pricing be fixed for the five years of the contract. The current Marin County Living Wage boosts the hourly rate shown in the contract to arrive at the invoiced rate. In this way, the firms proposing were not being asked to pad their pricing to cover the unknown increases in the Living Wage for the next five years.

The recommended award amount of \$7,700,000 is a Not to Exceed amount. Note, this amount is less than the amount presented to the Finance and Policy Executive Committee which had accounted for guards to be funded under the increased Sales Tax amount. Instead, Staff will return in November/December with an increased budget should the Sales Tax Renewal go forward. In no case will the annual expenditure

exceed the amount authorized by the Board in the approved annual budget. Actual cost will be based on the Marin County Living Wage and number of guards deployed. ACMS has verified that the pricing is good for a wide variance of actual guards in the field, allowing TAM to increase guards, currently being considered as part of the renewed transportation sales tax.

NEXT STEPS:

TAM will continue to monitor the performance of ACMS. Unannounced audits are performed by TAM staff, checking on guard attendance and performance. The frequency of these audits will be increased during the initial months of the new contract.

Attached is the current guard list with the two funding cut-off lines shown. This contract will fund the top 58 guards and 21 of the guards between rank 59 and 96 until January 2019 only. Should the Transportation Sales Tax renew in the interim, staff will return with a budget amendment.

ATTACHMENTS:

Guard List with Funding Cutoffs

**TAM Crossing Guard Program - 2017 Recertification
2017 Ranking Summary**

**Approved March 22, 2018
Updated June 2018**

2017 Rank	Location	City/Community	Total Weighted Score	Currently Guarded (2017-18)	Notes
1	Bahia Way & Kerner Boulevard	San Rafael	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 145
2	Nova Albion Way at Vallecito School	San Rafael	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 140
3	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Oak Tree Lane	Fairfax	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 140
4	Center Road & Leland Drive	Novato	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 134
5	East Blithedale Avenue & Lomita Avenue	Mill Valley	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 133
6	Sutro Avenue & Dominic Drive	Novato	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 133
7	Paladini Road & Vineyard Road	Novato	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 132
8	East Strawberry Drive at Strawberry School	Marin County	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 129
9	Sir Francis Drake & Glen Drive	Fairfax	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 129
10	Camino Alto & Sycamore Avenue	Mill Valley	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 127
11	Tiburon Boulevard & Lyford Drive	Tiburon	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 124
12	Miller Avenue & Evergreen Avenue	Mill Valley	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 122
13	Woodland Avenue & Lindaro Street	San Rafael	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 120
14	Sutro Avenue (in front of Pleasant Vly Elementary)	Novato	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 120
15	Butterfield Road & Green Valley Court	San Anselmo	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 118
16	San Ramon Way & San Benito Way	Novato	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 116
17	177 North San Pedro Road	San Rafael	Note 1	X	2014 Score = 115
18	Miller Avenue & Almonte Boulevard	Mill Valley	146	X	
19	Sunset Parkway & Merritt Drive	Novato	141	X	
20	Doherty Drive & Rose Lane (East) (at Piper Park)	Larkspur	140	X	
21	Sunset Parkway & Ignacio Boulevard	Novato	133	X	
22	Shoreline Highway & Almonte Boulevard	Mill Valley	132	X	
23	Ross Common (at Post Office)	Ross	128	X	
24	Kerner Boulevard & Canal Street	San Rafael	124	X	
25	Lomita Drive (in front of Edna Maguire School)	Mill Valley	118	X	
26	Mohawk Avenue (in front of Neil Cummins School)	Corte Madera	115		Guard provided by others
27	Tiburon Boulevard & San Rafael Avenue	Tiburon	114	X	
28	McAllister Avenue & Stadium Way	Kentfield	113	X	
29	College Avenue & Stadium Way	Kentfield	112	X	
30	San Ramon Way & San Juan Court	Novato	112	X	
31	Lovell Avenue & Old Mill Street	Mill Valley	112	X	
32	Tiburon Boulevard & Avenida Mireflores	Tiburon	111	X	
33	Larkspur Plaza Drive (Tam Racket Club) & Doherty Drive	Larkspur	110	X	
34	Bell Lane & Enterprise Concourse	Mill Valley	110	X	

**TAM Crossing Guard Program - 2017 Recertification
2017 Ranking Summary**

**Approved March 22, 2018
Updated June 2018**

2017 Rank	Location	City/Community	Total Weighted Score	Currently Guarded (2017-18)	Notes
35	Bahia Way at School Entrance	San Rafael	110	X	
36	5th Avenue & River Oaks Drive	San Rafael	110	X	
37	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Laurel Grove Avenue (East)	Kentfield	109	X	
38	Alameda De La Loma & Calle De La Mesa (East)	Novato	109	X	
39	Karen Way (in front of school)	Tiburon	108	X	Guard Provided by Others for 2018/19
40	Lagunitas Road & Allen Avenue	Ross	108	X	
41	Hickory Avenue (near Mohawk Avenue)	Corte Madera	106	X	
42	Spindrift Passage & Prince Royal Passage	Corte Madera	106	X	
43	Knight Drive & Ashwood Court	San Rafael	106	X	
44	Las Gallinas Avenue & Elvia Court	San Rafael	105	X	
45	Magnolia Avenue & Wiltshire Avenue	Larkspur	101	X	
46	Lagunitas Road & Ross Common	Ross	99	X	
47	South Novato Boulevard & Lark Court	Novato	96	X	
48	Center Road & Wilson Avenue	Novato	93	X	
49	Tiburon Boulevard & Mar West Street	Tiburon	93	X	
50	Throckmorton Ave & Old Mill Street	Mill Valley	92	X	
51	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Marinda Dr	Fairfax	92	X	
52	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Manor Road	Kentfield	91		
53	Tiburon Boulevard & Stewart Drive	Tiburon	91		
54	Shoreline Highway & Pine Hill Road	Mill Valley	89	X	
55	Tiburon Boulevard & Trestle Glen Boulevard	Tiburon	88	X	
56	Wilson Avenue & Vineyard Road	Novato	87	X	
57	Oak Manor Drive (mid-block at school)	Fairfax	87	X	
58	South Novato Boulevard & Yukon Way	Novato	86	X	
Project funding Line without Sales Tax Renewal					
59	East Blithedale Avenue & Elm Avenue	Mill Valley	82	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
60	San Benito Way & San Ramon Way (south)	Novato	82	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
61	Mt Shasta Drive & Idylberry Road	Lucas Valley	81	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
62	Tiburon Boulevard & Kleinert Way/Ned's Way	Tiburon	81	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
63	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Bon Air Road	Kentfield	79		
64	Nova Albion Way & Montecillo Road	San Rafael	78		
65	Olive Avenue (in back of school)	Novato	78	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
66	College Avenue & Woodland Avenue/Kent Avenue	Kentfield	75	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
67	Butterfield Road & Rosemont Avenue (in front of School)	San Anselmo	75	X	Guard funded thru December 2018

**TAM Crossing Guard Program - 2017 Recertification
2017 Ranking Summary**

**Approved March 22, 2018
Updated June 2018**

2017 Rank	Location	City/Community	Total Weighted Score	Currently Guarded (2017-18)	Notes
68	Blackstone Drive & Las Gallinas Avenue	San Rafael	74	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
69	San Marin Drive & San Ramon Way	Novato	74	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
70	Adams Street & Johnson Street	Novato	73	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
71	Redwood Highway & NB Off-Ramp/DeSilva Drive (at POC)	Marin County	73		
72	Olema-Bolinas Road (in Front of School)	Bolinas	73	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
73	Las Gallinas Avenue & Miller Creek Road	San Rafael	72	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
74	Woodland Avenue & Eva Street	San Rafael	70		
75	Magnolia Avenue & King Street	Larkspur	70	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
76	Tiburon Boulevard & East Strawberry Drive	Marin County	70		
77	Redwood Highway & Southbound Seminary Drive On-Ramp	Mill Valley	70	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
78	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & College Avenue	Kentfield	69	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
79	One Main Gate Road at School	Novato	69	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
80	Ricardo Lane & East Strawberry Drive	Marin County	68		
81	Happy Lane & 5th Avenue	San Rafael	68	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
82	Blackfield Drive & Cecilia Way	Tiburon	68		
83	Gibson Avenue & Shoreline Highway	Tamalpais Valley	67		
84	Belle Avenue (in front of school)	San Rafael	67	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
85	East Blithedale Avenue & Buena Vista Avenue	Mill Valley	67		
86	Center Road & Tamalpais Avenue	Novato	65	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
87	Avenida Mireflores at School	Tiburon	65	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
88	North San Pedro Road & Roosevelt Avenue	San Rafael	65	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
89	Marinwood Avenue & Miller Creek Road	San Rafael	65		
90	Woodland Avenue & Lovell Avenue	San Rafael	64		
91	Corte Madera Avenue & Tamalpais Drive (& Redwood)	Corte Madera	63		
92	Wilson Avenue at X-walk to field	Novato	63	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
93	Ross Avenue & Kensington Road	San Anselmo	61		
94	Nova Albion Way & Arias Street	San Rafael	61	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
95	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Oak Manor Drive	Fairfax	61		
96	South Novato Boulevard & Sunset Pkwy	Novato	61	X	Guard funded thru December 2018
Project Funding Line with Sales Tax Renewal					
97	West Castlewood Drive & Knight Drive	San Rafael	60		Guard provided by others
98	Woodland Avenue (at back of Wade Thomas school)	San Anselmo	59		
99	Tiburon Boulevard & Blackfield Drive	Tiburon	59	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
100	Almonte Boulevard & Rosemont Avenue	Mill Valley	59		

**TAM Crossing Guard Program - 2017 Recertification
2017 Ranking Summary**

**Approved March 22, 2018
Updated June 2018**

2017 Rank	Location	City/Community	Total Weighted Score	Currently Guarded (2017-18)	Notes
101	Sunset Parkway & Lynwood Drive	Novato	57	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
102	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Broadmoor Avenue	San Anselmo	54		
103	Richmond Road & Belle Avenue	San Anselmo	54		
104	Shoreline Highway (in front of West Marin School)	Point Reyes Station	53	X	Guard to be Discontinued for 2018/19
105	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Saunders Avenue	San Anselmo	52		
106	Golden Hind Passage (in front of school)	Corte Madera	52		
107	San Marin Drive & San Carlos Way	Novato	52		
108	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Lagunitas Road	Ross	51		Guard provided by others
109	Center Road & Diablo Avenue	Novato	51	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
110	Arthur Street & Hayes Street	Novato	48	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
111	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Butterfield Road	San Anselmo	47		
112	Marin Street & Bayview Street	San Rafael	46		
113	Racquet Club Drive & 5th Avenue	San Rafael	45		
114	Arthur Street & Cambridge Street	Novato	43	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
115	Grand Avenue & Jewell Street	San Rafael	43		
116	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Tamal Avenue	San Anselmo	42	X	Guard to be Discontinued for 2018/19
117	Blackfield Drive & Karen Way	Tiburon	42		
118	Sutro Avenue & Center Road	Novato	42		
119	Melrose Avenue & Evergreen Avenue	Tamalpais Valley	41		
120	Arthur Street & Taft Court/Tyler Street	Novato	41		
121	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Wolfe Grade	Kentfield	40	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
122	Bellam Boulevard & I-580 on ramp	San Rafael	38		
123	Arias Street & Trellis Drive	San Rafael	38		
124	Avenida Mireflores & Hilary Drive	Tiburon	38		
125	Montford Avenue & Melrose Avenue	Tamalpais Valley	35		
126	Paradise Drive & Seawolf Passage	Corte Madera	35	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
127	End of Tinker Way	Novato	34		
128	Wilson Avenue & Hansen Road	Novato	34		
129	Nova Albion Way & Las Gallinas Avenue	San Rafael	33		
130	Tamalpais Drive & Eastman Avenue	Corte Madera	32	X	Guard funded thru June 2019
131	Woodland Avenue & Siebel Street	San Rafael	31		
132	Bellam Boulevard & I-580 off ramp	San Rafael	31		
133	Lincoln Avenue & Paloma Avenue	San Rafael	29		
134	Kleinert Way & Neds Avenue	Tiburon	27		

**TAM Crossing Guard Program - 2017 Recertification
2017 Ranking Summary**

**Approved March 22, 2018
Updated June 2018**

2017 Rank	Location	City/Community	Total Weighted Score	Currently Guarded (2017-18)	Notes
135	Main Gate Road & C Street	Novato	27		
136	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Bolinas Avenue	San Anselmo	23		
137	Bellam Boulevard & Anderson Drive	San Rafael	19		
138	Bellam Boulevard & Francisco Boulevard East	San Rafael	16		
139	Trumbull Avenue & Vineyard Road	Novato	14		
140	Olive Avenue & Summers Avenue	Novato	13		
141	Diablo Avenue & Hotchkin Drive	Novato	5		
142	Evergreen Avenue & Ethel Avenue	Tamalpais Valley	Note 2		2014 Score = 41
143	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Meadow Way	San Geronimo	Note 2		2014 Score = 39
144	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & South Eliseo Drive	Kentfield	Note 2		2014 Score = 37
145	Richmond Road & Mariposa Avenue	San Anselmo	Note 2		2014 Score = 36
146	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Barber Avenue/Ross Avenue	San Anselmo	Note 2		2014 Score = 29
147	Olema-Bolinas Road & Mesa Road	Bolinas	Note 2		2014 Score = 28
148	Sequoia Drive & Red Hill Avenue (Miracle Mile)	San Anselmo	Note 2		2014 Score = 25
149	Sir Francis Drake Boulevard & Aspen Court	San Anselmo	Note 2		2014 Score = 21
150	Harvard Avenue & Wellesley Avenue	Tamalpais Valley	Note 2		2014 Score = 20

Notes:

- 1) No 2017 volume data collected. Ranked 30 or above in last two count cycles (shown in same ranked order as in 2014 ranked list)
- 2) No 2017 volume data collected. Ranked 110 or below in last two count cycles (shown in same ranked order as in 2014 ranked list)
- 3) Tie breaker for locations with the same score is based on the peak hour pedestrian volume (not combined volumes).

THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY