



**DATE:** June 11, 2018

**TO:** Transportation Authority of Marin Programming and Projects Executive Committee

**FROM:** Dianne Steinhauser, Executive Director  
David Chan, Programming Manager

**SUBJECT:** Prioritize Projects for Fifth Cycle Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP) Funds (Action),  
Agenda Item No. 8a

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Move to approve 1) prioritizing four projects for the Fifth Cycle of Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP) funds in the amount of \$560,204 as listed in Attachment B, 2) authorizing the Executive Director to make minor adjustments to the final funding amounts if the available funds are changed by MTC, and 3) refer the item to the TAM Board.

## **BACKGROUND**

TAM is responsible for establishing project priorities for the Fifth Cycle LTP for Fiscal Years 2016/17 through 2017/18. The Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) established the LTP to fund projects that result in improved mobility for low income residents of the Bay Area. The LTP is intended to fund projects that:

- are developed through a collaborative and inclusive planning process that includes broad partnerships among a variety of stakeholders such as public agencies, transit operators, community-based organizations and other community stakeholders, and outreach to underrepresented stakeholders;
- improve a range of transportation choices by adding a variety of new or expanded services including but not limited to: enhanced fixed route transit services, first-and last-mile shuttles, taxi voucher programs, and other eligible projects; and
- address transportation gaps and/or barriers identified in Community-Based Transportation Plans (CBTP) or other substantive local planning efforts involving focused outreach to low-income populations such as countywide or regional welfare-to-work transportation plans, the Coordinated Public Transit-Human Services Transportation Plan or other documented assessment of need.

On November 29, 2007, the TAM Board adopted eligibility requirements regarding these LTP funds that prioritized programming to projects identified in adopted Community Based Transportation Plans. It is the intent of the policy that LTP funds would only be programmed to CBTP projects until all identified projects have been either completed or no longer needed or when the CBTPs are updated to introduce new projects.

The three existing CBTPs include Marin City, Canal Neighborhood in San Rafael, and Novato.

**FUNDS AVAILABLE**

The funding for the Fifth Cycle of the LTP is a combination from two sources:

<b>Source</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1) State Transit Assistance (STA) funds	\$386,041
2) Federal Section 5307 Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) funds	\$174,163
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$560,204</b>

Projects recommended for funding by the TAM board are eligible to be exchanged or “swapped” for fund sources more ideally suited for the specific project type. The concept of swapping funds is part of the MTC adopted Lifeline policy and has been practiced by TAM in the past. Note replacement projects ideally must meet all applicable requirements for the original fund source.

All projects will be subject to a “use it or lose it” policy. Sponsors must expend LTP funds within three years of grant award or execution of sub-recipient agreement with MTC, whichever is applicable.

While MTC has provided a specific amount available for programming, these amounts may later fluctuate slightly, particularly with STA funds that are based on gas tax collection. The annual result on gas tax collection is usually realized around September. Applicants have been informed that the programmed amounts may differ than the actual amounts, but the difference is generally no more than 5%. In prior cycles of the LTP, the TAM Board authorized the Executive Director to make minor adjustments to the final funding amounts if the available funds are later changed by MTC.

**CALL FOR PROJECTS**

TAM issued a Call for Projects on March 7, 2018 for \$560,204 in available funds. Seven applications were received. The applications received are shown in the below table:

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Project Name</b>
Marin City Community Service District	On-Demand Shuttle Project
Marin County	Drake Avenue/Cole Drive Pedestrian Improvements
Marin Transit	Route 245
Marin Transit	Maintain and Increase Service on Routes 36 and 122
Marin Transit	School Transportation Services to Novato Middle Schools
Marin Transit	Bus Stop Improvements
Novato	Downtown SMART Phase II
San Rafael	Canal Neighborhood Uncontrolled Crosswalk Improvement Project

Project descriptions and requested amounts are shown in Attachment A.

**ELIGIBLE RECIPIENT**

Of the all the applicants, only Marin Transit is an eligible recipient of JARC funds. While GGBHTD and SMART did not apply directly, GGBHTD and SMART are eligible recipients of STA funds in Marin County. GGBHTD and SMART are also eligible recipients of JARC funds.

If funded, the projects in Marin County, Novato, and San Rafael would need to be exchanged for eligible funds with Marin Transit, GGBHTD, SMART or MTC in order for the project to be programmed and funds allocated.

Staff will work out the fund exchange after the projects have been selected by the TAM Board.

## **EVALUATION CRITERIA AND REVIEW PANEL**

TAM is responsible for determining whether proposals meet the minimum LTP eligibility criteria, specifically if the project is identified in the Community Based Transportation Plan, what priority, and if there is an eligible sponsor and responsible fiscal agent. TAM is also responsible for assigning appropriate fund sources to each project. TAM was recommended to assemble a review panel of CMA staff, the local low-income or minority representative from MTC's Policy Advisory Committee, as well as representatives of local stakeholders, such as transit operators or other transportation providers or community-based organizations, to score and select projects.

Evaluation criteria were recommended by MTC to assess and select projects. The six criteria include (1) project need/stated goals and objectives, (2) community-identified priority, (3) implementation plan and project management capacity, (4) coordination and program outreach, (5) cost-effectiveness and performance indicators, and (6) project budget/sustainability. The Review Panel also considered prior allocation of funds that may be outstanding.

The Review Panel convened on May 30, 2018 to review the applications. The Review Panel consisted of David Chan and Derek McGill of TAM, Aprile Smith, Senior Planner for the San Francisco County Transportation Authority, and Veda Florez, representative of Marin County's Minority Representative for MTC's Policy Advisory Committee (PAC). Derek McGill manages the development of the CBTPs.

## **PROJECT PRIORITY**

Based on the evaluation criteria, and funding availability, the Review Panel determined that all applications submitted met the minimum requirement for funding, except for Novato's Downtown SMART Phase II. There were questions as to whether this project meets the CBTP requirement. The Novato CBTP identifies access to the Downtown SMART Station as a desired project, but this application is requesting funding for rail switches, electrical components, control system, and platform amenities. Even with uncertainties, the Review Panel reviewed Novato's application relative to the other applications.

The Review Panel prioritized the projects in the following order (high to low):

- 1) Marin Transit's Bus Stop Improvements
- 2) Marin County's Drake/Cole Pedestrian Improvements
- 2) San Rafael's Canal Neighborhood Uncontrolled Crosswalk Improvement Project
- 4) Marin Transit's School Transportation Service to Middle Schools
- 5) Marin City CSD's On-Demand Shuttle Program
- 6) Marin Transit's Routes 36 and 122
- 7) Marin Transit's Route 245
- 8) Novato's Downtown SMART Phase II

The priority was based on the committee's interpretation of the evaluation criteria provide by MTC, and the applications received. However, the Review Panel also considered factors such as prior funding, projects' history and importance, project's ranking in its respective CBTP and ongoing needs versus one-time funding for completion.

Marin Transit's applications for existing operating service Routes 36 and 245 currently meets Marin Transit's productivity by route performance standards as identified in the Short-Range Transit Plan prepared by Marin Transit. According to MTC's Lifeline Program Guidelines, the LTP is intended to address unmet transportation needs. As these Routes address these needs and meet productivity standards, the Review Panel determined that these Routes were not at risk of service cuts if these services were not recommended for funding. The Review Panel thought that Route 122 extension to East San Rafael is a new service that can be considered if more funds were available.

On a related note, SB1 will provide an infusion of new STA Revenue-Based and Population-Based funds starting in FY 18/19 that will be shared by transit operators in Marin including Marin Transit. Marin Transit is estimated to receive approximately \$350,000 in additional STA Revenue-Based funds and \$400,000 in additional STA Population-Based funds in FY 18/19 over the amounts received in FY 17/18 due to SB 1. These infusion of additional STA funds will help with Marin Transit's overall operating budget.

The Review Panel was informed that Marin City CSD received funding for the On-Demand Shuttle in the last Lifeline cycle - Fourth Cycle LTP - that has not been used. The Fourth Cycle funds are still available for implementation so recommending Fifth Cycle funding was viewed not necessary at this time.

Overall, the Review Panel thought that the applications were good projects that will provide tangible benefits to the communities. However, with only \$560,204 in available funds and over \$1.8 million in request, not all requests can be funded. Based on the ranking from the Review Panel, the three highest ranked applications can be fully funded as requested and the fourth ranked application can be partially funded as shown in Attachment B.

## **FISCAL IMPACTS**

There are no fiscal impacts with the programming of Lifeline funds unless TAM's funds, such as Measure A funds, are used to facilitate any funding exchanges. If any funding exchanges include TAM's funds, TAM's Budget would be amended to reflect any exchanges. If no funding exchanges are needed, the recipients of the Lifeline funds will enter into agreements directly with MTC.

If the Review Panel's recommendation is adopted, funds programmed to Marin Transit would not needed to be exchanged since Marin Transit is an eligible recipient of both STA and FTA Section 5307 funds. However, funds programmed to Marin County and San Rafael would need to be exchanged since neither are eligible recipient of these funds. Staff will explore all available options to exchange the funds for Marin County and San Rafael.

## **NEXT STEPS**

After the TAM Board approves the projects for funding, it is likely there will be a need to exchange funds. Staff will explore all possibilities and report outcome to the TAM Board. The TAM Board approved list of projects and any funding exchange proposals will be communicated to MTC for programming.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

Attachment A: Project Descriptions

Attachment B: Lifeline Funding Recommendations

THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY

<b>Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP) - 5th Cycle Applications Received</b>				
<b>Sponsor</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Project Cost</b>	<b>Local Match</b>	<b>Lifeline Amount Requested</b>
Marin City Community Services	<b>Marin City On-Demand Shuttle Program</b> - will serve Marin City, the most underserved community in Marin County. Marin City On-Demand Shuttle Program will expand service to centers of commerce and medical services; provide greater weekend access, and service the Marin City seniors.	\$350,000	\$140,000	\$210,000
Marin County	<b>Drake Avenue/Cole Drive Pedestrian Improvements</b> - Pedestrian crossing improvements including installation of rapid-flash pedestrian warning beacon, sidewalk improvements, and enhanced crosswalk markings at an intersection that provides connectivity from a large public housing complex to transit, community facilities, neighborhood shopping, and other residential	\$85,700	\$17,700	\$68,000
Marin Transit	<b>Route 245</b> - This project will support Route 245 shuttle service to connect welfare recipients and other low-income individuals to jobs and employment-related services as well hospitals and health care facilities. Route 245 operates between Central San Rafael and Contempo Marin with stops at the Marin County Civic Center, Northgate Mall, Kaiser and County Health and	\$355,012	\$180,849	\$174,163
Marin Transit	<b>Maintain and increase Marin City and Canal Transit Service (Routes 36 and 122)</b> - This project will help continue to fund all day and weekend transit service connecting low income and minority populations in the Canal Neighborhood of San Rafael and Marin City and fund a new fixed route service operating on school days to connect the San Rafael Transit Center to Pt. San	\$1,062,292	\$862,292	\$200,000
Marin Transit	<b>School Transportation Service to Novato Middle Schools</b> - This project initiates yellow bus or supplemental service to San Jose and Sinaloa Middle Schools in the City of Novato. The project would provide for two buses on school days only.	\$230,080	\$30,080	\$200,000
Marin Transit	<b>Bus Stop Improvements</b> - This project will fund bus stop improvements and real time transit information signs in the Canal neighborhood of San Rafael and additional real time transit information signs at high usage stops in the City of Novato.	\$254,190	\$54,190	\$200,000
Novato	<b>Downtown SMART Phase II</b> - Design and construction of a functional Downtown Novato SMART Station, including rail switches, electrical components, Positive Train Control system, and platform amenities. The Downtown Novato SMART Station platform construction and through-rails were completed under the first phase of the project.	\$5,200,000	\$4,680,000	\$520,000
City of San Rafael	<b>Canal Neighborhood Uncontrolled Crosswalk Improvement Project</b> - Make improvements to uncontrolled crosswalks in the Canal Neighborhood including but no limited to, adding signage, reapid flashing beacons, restriping, installing ADA curb ramps and adding bulb outs.	\$310,000	\$62,000	\$248,000
			<b>Requested</b>	\$1,820,163
			<b>Available (\$386,041 in State STA and \$174,163 in Federal JARC)</b>	\$560,204

THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY

<b>Lifeline Transportation Program (LTP) - 5th Cycle Funding Recommendation</b>										
<b>Sponsor</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Ranking in Respective CBTPs</b>	<b>CBTP Communities Served</b>	<b>Received Prior LTP Funding</b>	<b>Leveraged non- LTP Funds</b>	<b>Project Cost</b>	<b>Local Match</b>	<b>Group Ranking</b>	<b>Lifeline Amount Requested</b>	<b>Funding Recommendation</b>
Marin City CSD	Marin City On-Demand Shuttle Program	1 of 17	Marin City	Yes	40%	\$350,000	\$140,000	5	\$210,000	\$0
Marin County	Drake Avenue/Cole Drive Pedestrian Improvements	3 of 17	Marin City	No	21%	\$85,700	\$17,700	2	\$68,000	\$68,000
Marin Transit	Route 245	Not Ranked	Canal	No	51%	\$355,012	\$180,849	7	\$174,163	\$0
Marin Transit	Maintain & increase Marin City & Canal Transit Service: Routes 36	R36: N.R. R122: 1 of	R36: Canal/M.C.	No	81%	\$1,062,292	\$862,292	6	\$200,000	\$0
Marin Transit	School Transportation Service to Novato Middle Schools	17 of 25	Novato	No	13%	\$230,080	\$30,080	4	\$200,000	\$44,204
Marin Transit	Bus Stop Improvements	5 of 15	Canal & Novato	No	21%	\$254,190	\$54,190	1	\$200,000	\$200,000
Novato	Downtown SMART Phase II	Not Ranked	Novato	No	90%	\$5,200,000	\$4,680,000	8	\$520,000	\$0
San Rafael	Canal Neighborhood Uncontrolled Crosswalk Improvement Project	2 of 15	Canal	No	20%	\$310,000	\$62,000	2	\$248,000	\$248,000
<b>Total</b>									\$1,820,163	\$560,204
<b>Available (\$386,041 in State STA and \$174,163 in Federal JARC)</b>										\$560,204
<b>Remaining</b>										\$0

THIS PAGE LEFT BLANK INTENTIONALLY